

On *asiddhavat*

Shinobu Mase
Hiroshima University

In the *Aṣṭādhyāyī* there are three rules in which the term *asiddha* is used: P.6.1.86 *ṣatvatukor asiddhaḥ*, P.6.4.22 *asiddhavat atrā bhāt*, P.8.2.1 *pūrvatrāsiddham*. According to Nāgeśa, what is meant by the term *asiddha* in these rules is *śāstrāsiddha* ‘the absence (*asiddha*) of a rule (*śāstra*)’. A question arises: For what purpose is the term *asiddhavat*, where the affix *vatI* is added to the term *asiddha*, used in P.6.4.22? No studies have ever tried to answer this question. The term *asiddhavat* has been considered in the past simply as synonymous with the term *asiddha*. However, Pāṇini must have had a conscious intention of distinguishing *asiddhavat* from a mere *asiddha*. In this paper I shall make clear what Pāṇini intends to say by making a specific mention of the term *asiddhavat* in P.6.4.22.

The point I would like to make is that if a rule is referred to by the term *asiddha*, the rule is simply treated as *asiddha*; on the other hand, if a rule is referred to by the term *asiddhavat*, the rule is treated as *asiddha* or remains *siddha* and that this is supported by Patañjali’s arguments about Pāṇini’s use of the term *sthānivat* in P.1.1.56. Consider the following derivation of *śādhi* (*śās* ‘teach’, 2nd sg. imperative).

- (1) *śās* + *lot* P.3.3.162
 - (2) *śās* + *siP* P.3.4.78
 - (3) *śās* + *hi* P.3.4.87
 - (4) *śā* + *hi* P.6.4.35
 - (5) *śā* + *dhi* P.6.4.101
- śādhi*

At stage (4) P.6.4.101 which provides that *dhi* replaces *hi* and P.6.4.35 which provides that *śā* replaces *śās* are applicable. If the term *asiddha* were used instead of the term *asiddhavat* in P.6.4.22, it would follow that both P.6.4.101 and P. 6.4.35 are *asiddha* and hence that they cannot apply since they are treated as non-existent. However P.6.4.22 has the term *asiddhavat*, so that both rules can remain *siddha*. Accordingly, P.6.4.35, which is *nitya* with respect to P.6.4.101, applies.

At stage (5), on the other hand, after the replacement of *śās* by *śā* takes place by P.6.4.35, P.6.4.101 cannot apply since the cause for its application is absent. By P.6.4.22, however, P.6.4.35 is treated as *asiddha* (*asiddhavat*), which means that it is treated as though it had not applied. Consequently P.6.4.101 applies.